

RECEIVED
19 DEC 10 AM 11:19
HEARINGS CLERK
TRAIL REGION 10

BEFORE THE
UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

In the Matter of:) DOCKET NO. FIFRA-10-2020-0021
)
CARIBOU TRAIL)
PEST CONTROL, LLC,) CONSENT AGREEMENT
)
)
Okanogan, Washington,)
)
Respondent.

I. STATUTORY AUTHORITY

1.1. This Consent Agreement is issued under the authority vested in the Administrator of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA”) by Section 14(a) of the Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act (“FIFRA”), 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a).

1.2. Pursuant to Section 14(a) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), and in accordance with the “Consolidated Rules of Practice Governing the Administrative Assessment of Civil Penalties,” 40 C.F.R. Part 22, EPA issues, and Caribou Trail Pest Control, LLC (“Respondent”) agrees to issuance of, the Final Order attached to this Consent Agreement (“Final Order”).

II. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

2.1. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. §§ 22.13(b) and 22.18(b), issuance of this Consent Agreement commences this proceeding, which will conclude when the Final Order becomes effective.

2.2. The Director of the Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division, EPA Region 10 (“Complainant”) has been delegated the authority pursuant to Section 14(a) of FIFRA,

7 U.S.C. § 136l(a), to sign consent agreements between EPA and the party against whom an administrative penalty for violations of FIFRA is proposed to be assessed.

2.3. Part III of this Consent Agreement contains a concise statement of the factual and legal basis for the alleged violations of FIFRA together with the specific provisions of FIFRA and the implementing regulations that Respondent is alleged to have violated.

III. ALLEGATIONS

3.1. Under Section 12(a)(2)(G) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(G), it is unlawful for any person to use any registered pesticide in a manner inconsistent with its labeling.

3.2. Under Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s), “person” means “any individual, partnership, association, corporation, or any organized group of persons whether incorporated or not.”

3.3. Under Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u), “pesticide” includes, *inter alia*, “any substance or mixture of substances intended for preventing, destroying, repelling, or mitigating any pest.”

3.4. Under Section 2(ee) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(ee), “to use any registered pesticide in a manner inconsistent with its labeling” means “to use any registered pesticide in a manner not permitted by the labeling,” subject to limited exceptions.

3.5. Under Section 2(p)(2) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(p)(2), “labeling” includes, *inter alia*, “all labels and all other written printed, or graphic matter [] accompanying the pesticide or device at any time.”

3.6. Under Section 2(p)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(p)(1), “label” means “the written, printed, or graphic matter on, or attached to, the pesticide or device or any of its containers or wrappers.”

3.7. Under Section 2(e)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(2)(e), “certified applicator” means “any individual who is certified under section [11 of FIFRA] as authorized to use or supervise the use of any pesticide which is classified for restricted use.

3.8. Under Section 2(e)(3) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(3)(e), “commercial applicator” means “an applicator . . . who uses or supervises the use of any pesticide which is classified for restricted use for any purpose or on any property other than as provided in Section 2(e)(2) of FIFRA [regarding “Private applicators”].”

3.9. “Tordon 22K,” (EPA Registration No. 62719-6), is a “pesticide” as defined by Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u). EPA classified Tordon 22K under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a, as a “Restricted Use Product.”

3.10. “Weedmaster” (EPA Registration No. 71368-34) is a “pesticide” as defined by Section 2(u) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(u). EPA classified Weedmaster under Section 3 of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136a, as a “General Use Product.”

3.11. The labeling for Tordon 22K states in part: “Do not apply directly to water, to areas where surface water is present or to intertidal areas below the mean high water mark. . . .Picloram is known to leach through soil into ground water under certain conditions as a result of agricultural use. Use of this chemical in areas where soils are permeable, particularly where the water table is shallow, may result in ground water contamination.”

3.12. The labeling for Weedmaster states in part: “This pesticide is toxic to fish and aquatic invertebrates. Do not apply directly to water, to areas where surface water is present, or to intertidal areas below the mean high water mark. Drift and runoff may be hazardous to aquatic organisms in water adjacent to treated areas.”

3.13. The active ingredient in Tordon 22K is picloram-potassium.

3.14. The active ingredients in Weedmaster are dicamba and 2,4-D, dimethylamine salt.

3.15. Respondent is a “person” as defined by Section 2(s) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(s).

3.16. On June 6, 2016, an agent of Respondent applied Tordon 22K and Weedmaster to a drainage ditch along Coyote Creek Road (approximate coordinates: 48°13'08.4" N - 119°11'53.2" W). At the time of application, the drainage ditch contained surface water.

3.17. On June 6, 2016, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(G) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(G), by applying the pesticide Tordon 22K in a manner inconsistent with its labeling.

3.18. On June 6, 2016, Respondent violated Section 12(a)(2)(G) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136j(a)(2)(G), by applying the pesticide Weedmaster in a manner inconsistent with its labeling.

3.19. At all times relevant to this Consent Agreement, the agent of Respondent who conducted the application described in Paragraph 3.16, above, has been a “certified applicator” and a “commercial applicator” as those terms are defined at Section 2(e)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136(e)(1).

3.20. Pursuant to Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(1), and 40 C.F.R. Part 19, any commercial applicator who violates any provision of FIFRA may be assessed a civil penalty of not more than \$19,936 for each offense.

3.21. Pursuant to Section 14(a)(2) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(2), and 40 C.F.R. Part 19, any private applicator or other person not included in Section 14(a)(1) of FIFRA, who holds or applies registered pesticides, only to provide a service of controlling pests without delivering any unapplied pesticides to any person so served, and who violates any provision of FIFRA, may

be assessed a civil penalty of not more than \$1,884 for the first offense and \$2,924 for each subsequent offense.

IV. TERMS OF SETTLEMENT

4.1. Respondent admits the jurisdictional allegations of this Consent Agreement.

4.2. Respondent neither admits nor denies the specific factual allegations contained in this Consent Agreement.

4.3. In determining the amount of penalty to be assessed, EPA has taken into account the factors specified in Section 14(a)(4) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(4). After considering all of these factors, EPA has determined and Respondent agrees that an appropriate penalty to settle this action is \$2,000 (the "Assessed Penalty").

4.4. Respondent agrees to pay the Assessed Penalty within 30 days of the effective date of the Final Order.

4.5. Payments under this Consent Agreement and the Final Order may be paid by check (mail or overnight delivery), wire transfer, ACH, or online payment. Payment instructions are available at: <http://www2.epa.gov/financial/makepayment>. Payments made by a cashier's check or certified check must be payable to the order of "Treasurer, United States of America" and delivered to the following address:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Fines and Penalties
Cincinnati Finance Center
P.O. Box 979077
St. Louis, Missouri 63197-9000

Respondent must note on the check the title and docket number of this action.

4.6. Concurrently with payment, Respondent must serve photocopies of the check, or proof of other payment method, described in Paragraph 4.5 on the Regional Hearing Clerk and EPA Region 10 at the following addresses:

Regional Hearing Clerk
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Region 10, Mail Stop: 11 – C07
1200 Sixth Avenue, Suite 155
Seattle, Washington 98101
young.teresa@epa.gov

Nicholas Hurwit
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Region 10, Mail Stop: 20 – C04
1200 Sixth Avenue, Suite 155
Seattle, Washington 98101
Hurwit.nicholas@epa.gov

4.7. If Respondent fails to pay any portion of the Assessed Penalty in full by its due date, the entire unpaid balance of the Assessed Penalty and accrued interest shall become immediately due and owing. If such a failure to pay occurs, Respondent may be subject to a civil action under Section 14(a)(5) of FIFRA, 7 U.S.C. § 136l(a)(5), to collect any unpaid penalties, together with interest, handling charges, and nonpayment penalties, as set forth below.

4.8. If Respondent fails to pay any portion of the Assessed Penalty in full by its due date, Respondent shall also be responsible for payment of the following amounts:

a. Interest. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(a)(1), any unpaid portion of the Assessed Penalty shall bear interest at the rate established by the Secretary of the Treasury from the effective date of the Final Order contained herein, provided, however, that no interest shall be payable on any portion of the Assessed Penalty that is paid within 30 days of the effective date of the Final Order contained herein.

b. Handling Charge. Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(1), a monthly handling charge of \$15 shall be paid if any portion of the Assessed Penalty is more than 30 days past due.

c. **Nonpayment Penalty.** Pursuant to 31 U.S.C. § 3717(e)(2), a nonpayment penalty of 6% per annum shall be paid on any portion of the Assessed Penalty that is more than 90 days past due, which nonpayment shall be calculated as of the date the underlying penalty first becomes past due.

4.9. The Assessed Penalty, including any additional costs incurred under Paragraph 4.8, represents an administrative civil penalty assessed by EPA and shall not be deductible for purposes of federal taxes.

4.10. The undersigned representative of Respondent certifies that he or she is authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Agreement and to bind Respondent to this document.

4.11. Except as described in Paragraph 4.8, each party shall bear its own costs and attorneys' fees in bringing or defending this action.

4.12. For the purposes of this proceeding, Respondent expressly waives any affirmative defenses and the right to contest the allegations contained in the Consent Agreement and to appeal the Final Order.

4.13. The provisions of this Consent Agreement and the Final Order shall bind Respondent and its agents, servants, employees, successors, and assigns.

4.14. Respondent consents to the issuance of any specified compliance or corrective action order, to any conditions specified in this consent agreement, and to any stated permit action.

4.15. The above provisions in Part IV are STIPULATED AND AGREED upon by Respondent and EPA Region 10.

DATED:

11/26/2019

FOR RESPONDENT:

Terry Crum

TERRY CRUM, Owner
Caribou Trail Pest Control, LLC

DATED:

12/4/2019

FOR COMPLAINANT:

Edward J. Kowalski

EDWARD J. KOWALSKI, Director
Enforcement and Compliance Assurance Division
EPA Region 10

BEFORE THE
UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY

In the Matter of:) DOCKET NO. FIFRA-10-2020-0021
)
CARIBOU TRAIL)
PEST CONTROL, LLC,) **FINAL ORDER**
)
)
Okanogan, Washington,)
)
Respondent.


1.1. The Administrator has delegated the authority to issue this Final Order to the Regional Administrator of EPA Region 10, who has redelegated this authority to the Regional Judicial Officer in EPA Region 10.

1.2. The terms of the foregoing Consent Agreement are ratified and incorporated by reference into this Final Order. Respondent is ordered to comply with the terms of settlement.

1.3. The Consent Agreement and this Final Order constitute a settlement by EPA of all claims for civil penalties under FIFRA for the violations alleged in Part III of the Consent Agreement. In accordance with 40 C.F.R. § 22.31(a), nothing in this Final Order shall affect the right of EPA or the United States to pursue appropriate injunctive or other equitable relief or criminal sanctions for any violations of law. This Final Order does not waive, extinguish, or otherwise affect Respondent's obligations to comply with all applicable provisions of FIFRA and regulations promulgated or permits issued thereunder.

1.4. This Final Order shall become effective upon filing with the Regional Hearing Clerk.

SO ORDERED this 16th day of December, 2019.


RICHARD MEDNICK
Regional Judicial Officer
EPA Region 10

Certificate of Service

The undersigned certifies that the original of the attached **CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER, In the Matter of: Caribou Trail Pest Control, LLC, Docket No.: FIFRA-10-2020-0021**, was filed with the Regional Hearing Clerk and served on the addressees in the following manner on the date specified below:


The undersigned certifies that a true and correct copy of the document was delivered to:

Brett S. Dugan
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Region 10, Mail Stop 11 – C07
1200 Sixth Avenue, Suite 155
Seattle, Washington 98101

Further, the undersigned certifies that a true and correct copy of the aforementioned document was placed in the United States mail certified/return receipt to:

Terry Crim
Owner
Caribou Trail Pest Control, LLC
1845 Old Highway 97,
Okanogan, Washington 98840-8222

DATED this 10 day of December, 2019.



TERESA YOUNG
Regional Hearing Clerk
EPA Region 10